

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/67536> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Kong, D.

Title: Civil liability for damage caused by global navigation satellite system

Issue Date: 2018-12-17

Civil Liability for Damage caused by
Global Navigation Satellite System

To my daughter KONG Li (孔礼)

Civil Liability for Damage caused by Global Navigation Satellite System

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op maandag 17 december 2018
klokke 16.15 uur

door

Dejian Kong

geboren te Shandong, China

in 1988

Promotoren: Prof. dr. P.M.J. Mendes de Leon
Prof. dr. A. Masutti (University of Bologna, Italy)

Promotiecommissie: Prof. dr. C.G. Breedveld-de Voogd
Prof. dr. iur. W. Müller-Rostin (University of Cologne,
Germany)
Dr. B.H.M. Custers
Prof. dr. J. Huang, (Wuhan University, China)

This research project is funded by the China Scholarship Council (CSC) and the National Research Center of Air Traffic Management Law and Standard (NRCATMLS), China.

Lay-out: AlphaZet prepress, Bodegraven
Printwerk: Ipskamp Printing

© 2018 Dejian Kong

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet van 1912 gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden vervoelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enig andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de auteur.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means without written permission of the author.

Contents

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	IX
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS	XI
GENERAL INTRODUCTION	XV
1 OVERVIEW OF GNSS: TECHNICAL BACKGROUND AND LEGAL FRAMEWORK	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Basic information about GNSS	1
1.2.1 PNT and GNSS	1
1.2.2 The constitution of GNSS	2
1.2.3 Applications of GNSS	3
1.2.4 GNSS performance parameters	4
1.2.5 Global nature of GNSS	6
1.3 GNSS risks and risk management	7
1.4 The establishment of an institutional and legal framework for GNSS	11
1.4.1 The need for an integrated governance of GNSS	11
1.4.2 Building the institutional structure of GNSS	11
1.4.2.1 The core of institutional issues	11
1.4.2.2 Internal institutions	11
1.4.2.3 International organizations	15
1.4.3 Shaping a legal system of GNSS	21
1.5 Concluding remarks	27
Annex	28
2 DEFINING CIVIL LIABILITY IN THE CONTEXT OF GNSS	31
2.1 Introduction	31
2.2 Scope of GNSS under the term GNSS civil liability	31
2.3 Concept of <i>liability</i> in the context of GNSS	34
2.3.1 Responsibility vs. Liability	34
2.3.2 Grounds of GNSS liability: criminal, administrative and civil	37
2.3.3 Structure of GNSS civil liability: contractual and non-contractual	40
2.4 Elements in establishing GNSS civil liability	50
2.4.1 Four elements of GNSS civil liability	50
2.4.2 The parties: GNSS providers vs GNSS users or/and third parties	51
2.4.3 Triggers: unreasonable acts	53

2.4.4	Damage: safety-of-life dangers	56
2.4.5	Causal link: a challenge to prove behind 'middle tools'	59
2.5	International characteristics of GNSS civil liability	61
2.6	Concluding remarks	63
3	INTERNATIONAL SPACE LAW FOR GNSS CIVIL LIABILITY: THE IDEAL VS THE REAL	65
3.1	Introduction	65
3.2	GNSS under international space law	66
3.2.1	Overview of international space law	66
3.2.2	The term 'space activity' in the context of GNSS	66
3.2.3	Sources of international space law concerning GNSS civil liability	68
3.3	Idealistic: a possible way to apply international space law to GNSS civil liability	71
3.3.1	Arguments on the applicability of international space law to GNSS civil liability	71
3.3.2	Definition of 'space object'	72
3.3.3	Broad interpretation of the term 'damage'	78
3.3.4	The matter of causation	83
3.3.5	Brief conclusion	90
3.4	Realistic: a less feasible mechanism for GNSS civil liability	90
3.5	Concluding remarks	99
4	INTERNATIONAL AIR LAW FOR GNSS CIVIL LIABILITY: AN ALTERNATIVE SOLUTION?	101
4.1	Introduction	101
4.2	GNSS under international air law	102
4.2.1	Legal implications of GNSS for international civil aviation	102
4.2.2	The use of GNSS for international civil aviation	103
4.2.3	How is GNSS technology changing the practice of international air law?	106
4.2.4	Sources of international air law concerning GNSS civil liability	111
4.3	State of play: the ICAO regime for GNSS civil liability	114
4.3.1	The mandate of ICAO on GNSS civil liability	114
4.3.2	Policy statement and guidance documents	115
4.3.3	Exchange of letters	117
4.3.4	Assembly Resolutions	122
4.3.5	SARPs and PANS	126
4.3.6	Brief conclusion	134
4.4	ATC civil liability for damage caused by GNSS?	135
4.4.1	Arguments on the relationship between ATC civil liability and GNSS civil liability	135
4.4.2	GNSS-based CNS/ATM vs traditional ATC	136

4.4.3	Article 28 of the Chicago Convention	139
4.4.3.1	State responsibility for the provision of ATC service	139
4.4.3.2	Do States have to introduce GNSS under Article 28 of the Chicago Convention?	140
4.4.3.3	The legal implications of Article 28 on ATC civil liability and GNSS civil liability	142
4.4.4	Why is the present regime of ATC civil liability not appropriate for the issue of GNSS civil liability?	144
4.4.4.1	Challenges arising from GNSS for the ATC civil liability regime	144
4.4.4.2	The failure of practice on the proposal for a multilateral convention	145
4.4.4.3	Fragmentation and diversification of national ATC civil liability regimes	146
4.4.4.4	Immunity of States providing ATC service	146
4.4.4.5	Missing link between ATC service provider/victims and GNSS provider	148
4.4.4.5.1	Fault-based system of ATC civil liability	148
4.4.4.5.2	No-fault system of ATC civil liability	150
4.4.4.5.3	The roadmap to establish the missing links	151
4.4.5	Brief conclusion	153
4.5	Air carrier civil liability for damage caused by GNSS?	154
4.5.1	Overview of the regime of air carrier civil liability	154
4.5.2	The legal connection between the regime of air carrier civil liability and GNSS	155
4.5.3	Contractual liability: from Warsaw to Montreal	156
4.5.4	Third-party liability: from Rome to Montreal	159
4.5.5	Brief conclusion	162
4.6	Concluding remarks	162
5	THE WAY FORWARD FOR GNSS CIVIL LIABILITY: FOCUSING ON THE PROVISION OF SAFETY-OF-LIFE SIGNALS	165
5.1	Introduction	165
5.2	The fairness of GNSS civil liability	166
5.2.1	The need for a fairness test on GNSS civil liability	166
5.2.2	Free-of-charge policy in the context of GNSS	166
5.2.2.1	Does a free-of-charge policy release the civil liability of GNSS providers?	166
5.2.2.2	Proposal for a policy on charges for GNSS safety-of-life signals	168
5.2.3	The problem of open signals in the context of GNSS civil liability	171
5.2.3.1	The classification of GNSS signals	171
5.2.3.2	Is there a contractual relationship in the provision of open signals?	171

5.2.3.3	The minimum duty of care in tort law for the provision of open signals	173
5.2.3.4	Proposal for an authorisation mechanism on GNSS safety-of-life signals	177
5.2.4	Legal effect of disclaimer of civil liability	179
5.2.4.1	Introduction to disclaimer of civil liability	179
5.2.4.2	Disclaimers of civil liability in the context of GNSS	180
5.2.4.3	The enforceability of disclaimers of civil liability in the context of GNSS	181
5.2.4.4	Proposal for a model clause concerning disclaimer of civil liability in the provision of GNSS safety-of-life signals	184
5.2.5	Brief conclusion	186
5.3	The roadmap to achieving an international solution for GNSS civil liability	186
5.3.1	The need for an international solution for GNSS civil liability	186
5.3.2	Unblocking sovereign immunity in the context of GNSS civil liability	187
5.3.2.1	The relevance of sovereign immunity	187
5.3.2.2	Sovereign immunity in the context of GNSS	187
5.3.2.3	Legal solution: proposal for a waiver of sovereign immunity in a legal instrument	189
5.3.2.4	Institutional solution: proposal for the commercialisation and corporatisation of GNSS	190
5.3.3	The feasible approach to GNSS civil liability	197
5.3.3.1	Various solutions for GNSS civil liability: from a practical perspective	197
5.3.3.2	Proposal for a contractual chain on GNSS civil liability in the provision of safety-of-life signals	199
5.3.4	The responsible organisations to push the way forward	202
5.3.5	Brief conclusion	207
5.4	Concluding remarks	208
	Annex I	209
	Annex II	212
	GENERAL CONCLUSION	219
	SAMENVATTING (SUMMARY IN DUTCH)	223
	SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY	229
	CURRICULUM VITAE	253

Acknowledgements

This doctoral thesis could not have been done without continuous supports and trust from the government, universities, friends and family.

The deepest gratitude goes to my supervisors, Prof. Pablo Mendes de Leon and Prof. Anna Masutti for their professional and dedicated cultivation with patience and encouragement during the whole process of my PhD research. My sincere thanks go further to Drs. Tanja Masson-Zwaan for her academic advisement. A special thanks to Ms. Paula van der Wulp and Ms. Natascha Meewisse, for all administrative assistance to make my research and life much easier in Leiden.

I appreciate all the inputs to the arrangement of my PhD defense. Special thanks to Prof. dr. C.G. Breedveld-de Voogd, Prof. dr. iur. W. Müller-Rostin, Dr. B.H.M. Custers and Prof. dr. J. Huang, who are members of my Doctorate committee; to Ms. Esmee ten Donkelaar for her help on all administrative matters; to Ms. Neta Palkovitz Menashy for providing thoughtful comments; to Mr. Stephen Machon and Mr. Roberto Cassar for editorial assistance in the English language; to Ms. Magdalena (Maggie) Kucko for her translation of summary into Dutch.

I would like to express my thanks to all the academic organisations for hosting me as a full-time or part-time researcher with a shorter or longer term. Special graduate is owed to Leiden University (The Netherlands), Beihang University (China), the University of Bologna (Italy), the European Institute of Space Policy (Austria), the International Institute for the Unification of Private Law (Italy), and China Academy of Strategy on Aerospace Engineering Science and Technology, for all the opportunities offered to me.

It would not be possible for me to study outside China without the inspiration and encouragement from Prof. LIU Baoyu & Mrs. LI Yanyan, Dr. LIU Hao and Dr. YANG Caixia. My further thanks go to Dr. ZHANG Weihua, CHEN Chen, YU Huai, DENG Yun, ZHANG Xin, LIANG Bingjie, and Dr. Fabio Tronchetti, for their support and advice from Beijing.

I am lucky to meet many friends for offering me a positive atmosphere. Particularly, I wish to thank Lalin Kovudhikulrungsri, Jinyoung Choi, YANG Jianxin, ZHANG Xiaoqian, HU Qiuyin, LIU Boyang, LI Xiang, TAN Yudan, SUN Linlin, ZHANG Wanlu, WANG Juan, Julian Rotter and Marilena Montanari. I also remember ideas inspired by young Chinese generations during lunch meetings in Kamerlingh Onnes Building. Although I may not be able to list all the names of my friends, I appreciate the friendship with them and all the help from them.

My greatest love goes to my wife Mrs. LI Zhenjie (李振杰) not only for her always being with me and limitless understanding, but also for the happiness brought by the birth and growing up of our lovely daughter KONG Li (孔礼) since January 2017. I owe special indebtedness to my parents and my parents-in-law. I also remember the support from my sister and her husband plus their boys, and my sister-in-law and her husband plus their boy.

List of Abbreviations and Acronyms

AAI	Airports Authority of India
ADS-B	Automatic Dependent Surveillance-Broadcast
Aerospace	Air & Space
ANS	Air Navigation Service
ANSP	Air Navigation Services Provider
APNT	Alternative Positioning, Navigation, and Timing
ASAS	African Satellite Augmentation System
ATC	Air Traffic Control
ATM	Air Traffic Management
ATS	Air Traffic Service
BDS	BeiDou Navigation Satellite System
CANSO	Civil Air Navigation Services Organisation
CGSIC	Civil GPS Service Interface Committee
Chicago Convention	Convention on International Civil Aviation
CNS/ATM	Communications, Navigation and Surveillance/ Air Traffic Management
COPUOS	Committee on the Peaceful Uses of Outer Space
CORS	Continuously Operating Reference Station
CSNO	China Satellite Navigation Office
DHS	US Department of Homeland Security
EC	European Commission
ECAC	European Civil Aviation Conference
EDAS	EGNOS Data Access Service
EGNOS	European Geostationary Navigation Overlay Service
eLoran	Enhanced Loran
ESA	European Space Agency
ESDP	European Security and Defence Policy
ESPI	European Space Policy Institute
ESSP SAS	European Satellite Services Provider
EU	European Union
EUROCONTROL	European Organisation for the Safety of Air Navigation
Eutelsat	European Telecommunications Satellite Organization
EUTELSAT IGO	European Telecommunications Satellite Organization
EWA	EGNOS Working Agreements
FAA	US Federal Aviation Administration
FANS	Future Air Navigation System
FANS Phase II	Special Committee for the Monitoring and Coordination of Development and Transition Planning for the Future Air Navigation System

FCC	US Federal Communications Commission
FIR	Flight Information Regions
GAGAN	GPS-aided GEO Augmented Navigation
Galileo	Galileo Satellite Navigation System
GANP	Global Air Navigation Plan
GAO	US Government Accountability Office
GBAS	Ground Based Augmentation System
GLONASS	Globalnaya Navigatsionnaya Sputnikovaya Sistema
GLS	GNSS Landing System
GNSS	Global Navigation Satellite System
GNSSP	Global Navigation Satellite System Panel
GPG	Global/World Public Good
GPS	Global Positioning System
GSA	European GNSS Agency
IATA	International Air Transportation Association
ICAO	International Civil Aviation Organization
ICG	International Committee on Global Navigation Satellite Systems
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
IFATCA	International Federation of Air Traffic Controllers' Associations
iGMAS	International GNSS Monitoring and Assessment
IGO	Inter-Governmental Organization
IGS	International GNSS Service
IISL	International Institute of Space Law
ILA	International Law Association
ILC	International Law Commission
ILS	Instrument Landing System
IMO	International Maritime Organization
IMSO	International Mobile Satellite Organization
INMARSAT	International Maritime Satellite Organization
INS	Inertial Navigation System
Intelsat	International Telecommunications Satellite Organization
ITSO	International Telecommunications Satellite Organization
ION	Institute of Navigation
IRNSS	Indian Regional Navigation Satellite System
ISO	International Organization for Standardization
IS-QZSS	Interface Specification for QZSS
ISRO	Indian Space Research Organization
ISS	International Space Station
ITU	International Telecommunication Union
ITU-R	ITU Radiocommunication Sector

LAAS	Local Area Augmentation System
Liability Convention	Convention on International Liability for Damage Caused by Space Objects
LTEP	ICAO Panel of Legal and Technical Experts on the establishment of a Legal Framework with Regard to GNSS
MLS	Microwave Landing System
Moon Agreement	Agreement Governing the Activities of States on the Moon and Other Celestial Bodies
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
MPA	Maritime and Port Authority of Singapore
MSAS	Multi-functional Satellite Augmentation System
MSC	Maritime Safety Committee
MUPLA	Model Uniform Products Liability Act
NAVCEN	US Coast Guard Navigation Center
NCL-CBU	Non-contractual liability vis-à-vis contractually bound users, such as civil liability claimed by commercial services
NCL-UNC	Non-contractual liability vis-à-vis users not bound by contract, such as civil liability claimed by open service users
NDGPS	Nationwide Differential GPS
NNSS	National Navigation Satellite System
NOAA	US National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration
NOC for Space-Based	National Coordination Office for Space-Based
PNT	Positioning, Navigation, and Timing
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
Outer Space Treaty	Treaty on Principles Governing the Activities of States in the Exploration and Use of Outer Space, including the Moon and Other Celestial Bodies
PANS	Procedures for Air Navigation Services
PANS-ATM	Procedures for Air Navigation Services-Air Traffic Management
PANS-OPS	Procedures for Air Navigation Services – Aircraft Operations
PBN	Performance-based Navigation
PNT	Positioning, Navigation and Timing
PPP	Public-Private Partnership
QSS	Quasi-Zenith Satellite System Services Inc.
QZSS	Quasi-Zenith Satellite System
Registration Convention	Convention on Registration of Objects Launched into Outer Space
Rescue Agreement	Agreement on the Rescue of Astronauts, the Return of Astronauts and Return of Objects Launched into Outer Space

RF	Radio Frequency
RNAV	Area Navigation
RNSS	Regional Navigation Satellite System
Rome Convention	Convention on Damage Caused by Foreign Aircraft to Third Parties on the Surface of 1952
Rome II Regulation	Regulation on the law applicable to non-contractual obligations
Roscosmos	Russian Federal Space Agency State Corporation for Space Activities
SA	Selective Availability
SAR	Search and Rescue
SARPs	Standards and Recommended Practices
SBAS	Satellite Based Augmentation System
SDCM	System for Differential Corrections and Monitoring
SDRs	Special Drawing Rights
SES	Single European Sky
SIS	Signal-in-Space
SMS	Safety Management Systems
SoL	Safety of Life
SPS	Standard Positioning Service
TRANSIT	Navy Navigation Satellite System
UN	United Nations
UNCC	United Nations Compensation Commission
UNGA	General Assembly of the United Nations
Unidroit	International Institute for the Unification of Private Law
UNISPACE III	Third United Nations Conference on the Exploration and Peaceful Uses of Outer Space
UNOOSA	System for Differential Corrections and Monitoring
US	United States
Vienna Convention	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties
WAAS	Wide Area Augmentation System
Warsaw Convention	Convention for the Unification of Certain Rules Relating Carriage by Air of 1929