Impurity-bound states and Green’s function zeros as local signatures of topology

Robert-Jan Slager, 1 Louk Rademaker, 2 Jan Zaanen, 1 and Leon Balents 2

1 Institute-Lorentz for Theoretical Physics, Leiden University, PO Box 9506, Leiden, The Netherlands
2 Kavli Institute for Theoretical Physics, University of California Santa Barbara, California 93106, USA

(Received 22 April 2015; published 17 August 2015)

We show that the local in-gap Green’s function of a band insulator $G_0(\epsilon, \mathbf{k}_i, \mathbf{r}_z = 0)$, with $\mathbf{r}_z$ the position perpendicular to a codimension-1 or codimension-2 impurity, reveals the topological nature of the phase. For a topological insulator, the eigenvalues of this Green’s function attain zeros in the gap, whereas for a trivial insulator the eigenvalues remain nonzero. This topological classification is related to the existence of in-gap bound states along codimension-1 and codimension-2 impurities. Whereas codimension-1 impurities can be viewed as soft edges, the result for codimension-2 impurities is nontrivial and allows for a direct experimental measurement of the topological nature of two-dimensional insulators.

DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevB.92.085126 PACS number(s): 73.20.Hb, 71.10.Fd


topology. This nontrivial result implies that by probing bound states around a point impurity in a two-dimensional (2D) insulator, one can experimentally distinguish between the topological and trivial phases.

Mathematically, the theory for impurity bound states shows that the existence of bound states in the topological phase is directly related to zero eigenvalues of the local in-gap Green’s function, see Fig. 1. Consequently, we propose that the presence or absence of zero eigenvalues in the local in-gap Green’s function is a signature of the band topology.

The remainder of this paper is organized as follows. We first introduce the model and the theory of impurity bound states. Then we show that the local in-gap Green’s function, relevant for codimension-1 and codimension-2 impurities, has zero eigenvalues if and only if the phase is topological. We then propose an experiment that directly probes the Green’s function zeros for a point impurity in a 2D insulator. Finally, we relate our results to the known $\mathbb{Z}_2$ classification and the bulk-boundary correspondence.

Theory of impurity bound states. We begin with a translationally invariant system, described by a minimal time-reversal-invariant two-band model. The generic Hamiltonian assumes the form

$$H_0 = \sum_{\mathbf{k}, \alpha, \beta} c^\dagger_{\mathbf{k}\alpha}d_{\mathbf{k}\alpha}(\mathbf{k})\gamma^{\mu}_{\alpha\beta}c_{\mathbf{k}\beta}$$

where $\gamma^{\mu}$ are the $4 \times 4$ Dirac $\gamma$ matrices satisfying a Clifford algebra. We choose $\gamma^0 = \sigma^0 \otimes \tau^3$ and $\gamma^{1} = \sigma^1 \otimes \tau^1$. Here, the $\sigma$ and $\tau$ Pauli matrices act in the spin and orbital space, respectively. Time-reversal (TR) symmetry then implies that $d_{\mathbf{k}\alpha}(\mathbf{k})$ must be even and $d_{\mathbf{k}\alpha}(\mathbf{k})$ must be odd function.

In particular, we focus on the representative cases that $d_{\mathbf{k}\alpha}(\mathbf{k}) = M - 2B \sum_{j}(1 - \cos k_j)$ and $d_{\mathbf{k}\alpha}(\mathbf{k}) = \sin k_j$ [25–27]. This is the familiar class of models displaying topological nontrivial regimes for parameter range $0 < M/B < 4d$. This specific choice is not expected to restrict our results, as a topological insulator generically has with adiabatic continuity the form of a lattice regularized massive Dirac Hamiltonian. The following results also apply to other lattice symmetries, as long as there are two orbitals per unit cell, such as the original Kane-Mele model on the honeycomb lattice [3]. Moreover, extra terms that respect TR symmetry will not change the results described below.

The real-frequency Green’s function in the gap reads

$$G_0(\omega, \mathbf{k}) = \frac{1}{\omega - d_{\mathbf{k}\alpha}(\mathbf{k})\gamma^{\mu}} = \frac{\omega I_4 + d_{\mathbf{k}\alpha}(\mathbf{k})\gamma^{\mu}}{\omega^2 - |d(\mathbf{k})|^2}.$$
Subsequently, we introduce an impurity into the system, which in general can be described by the Hamiltonian

$$H_V = \sum_{\alpha \beta} c_\alpha^\dagger V_{\alpha \beta}(\mathbf{r}) c_\beta.$$ \hfill (3)

To find the corresponding spectrum in the presence of the impurity, one needs to solve the (differential) Schrödinger equation

$$(H_0 + H_V)\psi_\epsilon(\mathbf{r}) = \epsilon \psi_\epsilon(\mathbf{r}),$$ \hfill (4)

where $\epsilon$ is the energy of the state. This can be transformed into an integral equation [28],

$$\psi_\epsilon(\mathbf{r}) = \sum_{\mathbf{r}'} G_0(\epsilon, \mathbf{r} - \mathbf{r}') V(\mathbf{r}') \psi_\epsilon(\mathbf{r}').$$ \hfill (5)

For an insulator, the real-frequency Green’s function is well behaved inside the gap and displays exponential decay as a function of $\mathbf{r}$. This implies that an in-gap solution of Eq. (5) will yield a bound state around the impurity.

The existence of an in-gap bound state depends on $H_0$ and the shape of the impurity potential $V(\mathbf{r})$. However, the qualitative difference between topological and trivial band insulators is found in Green’s function features, and is therefore largely independent of the choice of impurity potential. Let us therefore consider the simplest possible choice: a constant $V(\mathbf{r})$ along an $n$-dimensional plane in a $d$-dimensional system (hence codimension $d-n$). The $d$-dimensional position vector $\mathbf{r}$ can be split into the perpendicular coordinates $\mathbf{r}_\perp$ and the parallel coordinates $\mathbf{r}_\parallel$, so that the impurity potential is given by

$$V(\mathbf{r}) = V_0 \delta_{\mathbf{r}_\parallel,0},$$ \hfill (6)

where we have used a Kronecker $\delta$ to signify our use of lattice models and introduced the $4 \times 4$ Hermitian matrix $V_0$. We note that even if the potential $V(\mathbf{r})$ just couples directly to the electron density, $V_0$ is not necessarily diagonal when expressed in terms of the second quantized operators.

The shape of $V_0$ can be restricted, though, using symmetry principles. For example, when we consider nonmagnetic impurities, TR invariance applies to the impurity potential as well. As a result, the matrix $V_0$ has only six degrees of freedom,

$$V_0 = V_1 + V_0 \sigma^0 \otimes \tau^3 + V_1 \sigma^i \otimes \tau^2 + V_4 \sigma^0 \otimes \tau^1.$$ \hfill (7)

Recall that in this notation, time reversal is $T = i\sigma^2 K$, where $K$ is complex conjugation. Parity, on the other hand, is given by $\gamma^0 = \sigma^0 \otimes \tau^3$. If we require both parity and TR the form of $V_0$ is even further constrained to

$$V_0 = V_1 + V_0 \gamma^0.$$ \hfill (8)

Since the translational symmetry is not broken along directions parallel to the impurity, the impurity bound states have a well-defined parallel momenta $\mathbf{k}_\parallel$. Thus $\psi_\epsilon(\mathbf{r}) \propto e^{i\mathbf{k}_\parallel \cdot \mathbf{r}_\parallel}$ and the integral equation Eq. (5) reduces to an eigenvalue equation for each $\mathbf{k}_\parallel$,

$$\det[G_0(\epsilon, \mathbf{k}_\parallel, \mathbf{r}_\perp = 0)V_0 - 1] = 0.$$ \hfill (9)

We immediately notice that for the case $V_0 = V_1$, the existence of bound states is directly related to the eigenvalues of the local ($\mathbf{r}_\perp = 0$) in-gap Green’s function $G_0(\epsilon, \mathbf{k}_\parallel, \mathbf{r}_\perp = 0)$. Codimension-1 impurities. Let us now consider codimension-1 impurities, that is a surface in $d$- and a line in $d-2$-dimensional system, relevant for codimension-1 impurities.

$$g_\mu(\epsilon, \mathbf{k}_\perp = 0) = g_\perp(\epsilon, \mathbf{k}_\parallel) + g_\parallel(\epsilon, \mathbf{k}_\parallel) \gamma^\mu.$$ \hfill (10)

At any TR-symmetric point for the parallel momentum, for example, $\mathbf{k}_\parallel = 0$ or $\pi$, the $g_\perp$ vanishes. Additionally, $g_\parallel$ vanishes since the integrand is an odd function of $\mathbf{k}_\parallel$. At TR-symmetric points we thus only need to consider $g_0$ and $g$. We note that this still holds if we add, e.g., Rashba spin orbit coupling terms, that are odd functions of the momentum, to the bare Hamiltonian. As a Rashba term removes the particle hole symmetry of the original Hamiltonian and similar terms can be introduced to eliminate the inversion symmetry, the following results can thus also be verified in the absence of any other symmetry but TR symmetry.

\[\text{FIG. 1. (Color online) The eigenvalues of the local Green’s function } G_0(\epsilon, \mathbf{k}_\parallel = 0, \mathbf{r}_\perp = 0) \text{ in the } M/B \text{ model, relevant for codimension-1 (left) and codimension-2 (right) impurities. In the trivial system (dashed lines, } M/B = -1) \text{ the eigenvalues } \lambda_\pm \text{ are nonzero. In the topological system (solid line, } M/B = 1) \text{ the eigenvalues are zero for some in-gap energy and hence in-gap bound states always exist.}\]
We will now show that the eigenvalues of the local in-gap Green’s function \( G_0(\epsilon, k^\parallel, r^\perp = 0) \),
\[
\lambda_{\perp}(\epsilon) = g(\epsilon) \pm g_0(\epsilon),
\]
(12)
have the shape displayed in the left panel of Fig. 1. The difference between a topological insulator and a trivial insulator is whether the in-gap Green’s function has a zero eigenvalue or not.

Note that the denominator in the integrand, \( \epsilon^2 - |d|^2 \), is always negative. In the trivial phase \( d_0(k) \) does not change sign throughout the Brillouin zone. This implies that \( g(\epsilon) \) does not change sign. Additionally, because \( \epsilon < |d_0(k)| \), we have \( g(\epsilon) + |g_0(\epsilon)| > 0 \) and \( g(\epsilon) - |g_0(\epsilon)| < 0 \). Therefore, in the trivial phase, the Green’s function \( G_0(\epsilon, k^\parallel, r^\perp = 0) \) never has an eigenvalue equal to zero for all momenta \( k^\parallel \) and energies \( \epsilon \).

On the other hand, in the topological phase, when \( k^\parallel \) is chosen as a TR-symmetric point \( k_S \) associated with the projection describing the topological phase [12], the Green’s function for \( \epsilon = 0 \) satisfies \( G_0(\epsilon = 0, k^\parallel = k_S, r^\perp = 0) = 0 \). To prove this, we evaluate
\[
g_0(0, k_S) = -\int_{-\pi}^{\pi} \frac{dk}{2\pi} \frac{d_0(k, k_S)}{|d^2(k, k_S)|} = -\int_{-\pi}^{\pi} \frac{dk}{2\pi} \frac{\hat{M}(k_S) - 2B(1 - \cos k)}{\sin^2 k + |M(k_S) - 2B(1 - \cos k)|^2},
\]
where \( \hat{M}(k) = M - 2B \sum_{i=1}^{d-1}[1 - \cos(k_i)] \) in terms of the coordinates \( k_S \). Substituting \( x = e^{ik} \), the integral becomes a contour integral over the unit circle for which the solution depends on the poles inside the unit circle. We find that only in the topological regime \( 0 < M < 4B \), two poles with opposite residue reside in the unit circle rendering zero eigenvalues of the Green’s function \( g_0(\epsilon = 0) \). Together with the universal robust divergence of both \( g(\epsilon) \) and \( g_0(\epsilon) \) at the band edges, which is of relevance in the absence of particle hole symmetry, we arrive at the generic description as shown in Fig. 1.

Consequently, for any impurity strength a topological insulator will always have in-gap states along a codimension-1 impurity, whereas for a trivial insulator it depends on specific details of the impurity and the insulator. The codimension-1 impurity can thus be understood as a soft edge.

**Codimension-2 impurities.** The above results on the structure of the eigenvalues of \( G_0(\epsilon, k^\parallel, r^\perp = 0) \) in the codimension-1 case can be extended to codimension-2 impurities. In this case, there are two perpendicular directions \( k^\perp = (k^\parallel, k^\perp) \),
\[
\begin{align*}
G(\mu, k^\parallel) & = \int \frac{dk^\perp_1 dk^\perp_2}{(2\pi)^2} \frac{d_0(k_1^\parallel, k_2^\perp)}{\epsilon^2 - |d(k_1^\parallel, k_2^\perp)|^2}, \\
G(\epsilon, k^\parallel) & = \int \frac{dk_1^\parallel dk_2^\perp}{(2\pi)^2} \frac{\epsilon}{\epsilon^2 - |d(k_1^\parallel, k_2^\perp)|^2},
\end{align*}
\]
for \( \mu = 0, 1, 2, 3 \). It is clear that for any of the perpendicular directions \( G^\perp_\mu = 0 \), as the integrand is odd.

For the trivial phase, we can show that the eigenvalues of \( G_0(\epsilon, k^\parallel, r^\perp = 0) \) are nonzero throughout the gap, since the two-dimensional integral can be done by first integrating in one direction, which yields the results from the codimension-2 impurities, and then integrating along the second direction. Therefore, \( G_0(\epsilon, k^\parallel, r^\perp = 0) \) is never zero in the gap.

Of more interest is the question of existence of zero-energy eigenvalues in the topological regime. Let us focus on the two-dimensional case, so that there are no parallel directions: we are directly probing the local, on-site Green’s function. We expect that the terms \( \hat{G}(\epsilon) \) and \( G_0(\epsilon) \) will diverge close to the band edge. In fact, these divergences are captured by expanding around the point where the gap is minimal, \( k_G \),
\[
|d(k^\parallel, k^\perp)|^2 = \Delta^2 + a(k^\parallel - k_G^\parallel)^2 + b(k^\perp - k_G^\perp)^2 + \cdots.
\]
(15)
The diverging part of the integral is then captured by the integral
\[
\int \frac{dk^\parallel dk^\perp}{(2\pi)^2} \frac{1}{2\Delta \delta \epsilon + a(k^\parallel)^2 + b(k^\perp)^2}
\sim -\int_0^\pi dq \frac{q}{2\pi \sqrt{ab}} \frac{q}{2\Delta \delta \epsilon + q^2} \sim \frac{\log \delta \epsilon}{4\pi \sqrt{ab}},
\]
(16)
Hence, \( \hat{G}(\epsilon) \sim \frac{1}{2\Delta \delta \epsilon} \) and \( G_0(\epsilon) \sim \frac{d_0(k_G) \delta \epsilon}{4\pi \sqrt{ab}} \) in proximity of the valence band. The dependence of the gap \( \Delta \) on \( d_0(k) \) proves that both eigenvalues in the topological phase diverge to positive infinity at the valence band edge, and to minus infinity at the conduction band edge. Consequently, as this functional dependence is robust against small perturbations, in the topological phase the Green’s function eigenvalues must be zero somewhere in the gap. Details are provided in the Supplemental Material [13]. This proves that in \( d = 2 \), the completely local in-gap Green’s function \( G_0(\epsilon, r = 0) \) has zero eigenvalues if and only if the system is in the topological phase, see Fig. 1, right.

This result carries over to the case of line impurities in \( d = 3 \) topological insulators, if the remaining parallel momentum is chosen at one of the TR-symmetric points.

**Experiment.** The existence of these zero eigenvalues can be probed directly in experiments, using impurity bound states as solutions to Eq. (9). Imagine a two-dimensional insulator, where at one isolated point a tunable gate voltage is applied, serving as the impurity potential \( V \). Then using tunneling spectroscopy, the possible bound states around this impurity can be found. Upon increasing the impurity potential \( V \), the energies of the bound states shift: for a trivial insulator, one can make a bound state disappear into one of the bands by a sufficiently strong potential. However, our results show that for a topological insulator, for all strong \( V \) there will always be two bound states. Explicitly, the energy of the bound state as a function of \( V \) is shown in Fig. 2.

**Classification and the bulk-boundary correspondence.** The odd number of crossings per spin branch of \( G_0(\epsilon, k^\parallel, r^\perp = 0) \) with the zero eigenvalue axis is a topological property, similar to invariants based on the momentum space Green’s function [29–32]. It reflects that in the nontrivial regime the system has an odd number of Kramers degenerate edge states on either side of the surface and hence may be regarded as a consequence of the bulk-boundary correspondence [6,7]. In particular, the bulk TR \( Z_2 \) invariant is in this case simply the product \( \prod_{\Gamma} \xi_\Gamma \) of the parity \( \gamma^0 \) eigenvalues \( \xi_\Gamma \) over the TR points in the Brillouin zone [33]. Moreover, the two relevant poles have the same residues but multiplied by sign of the mass, i.e., the parity \( \gamma^0 \) eigenvalues. Hence, only if the choice \( k_S \) in the projected plane
is associated with two masses of opposite sign, meaning that this cut features a band inversion, the poles cancel in the above integral rendering a zero eigenvalue. This is in accordance with the space group classification [12].

For example, for \( d = 2 \) the model Eq. (1) exhibits a \( \Gamma - (T\cdot p4m) \) phase for \( 0 < M/B < 4 \) and a \( M - (T\cdot p4) \) phase for \( 4 < M/B < 8 \). From the above considerations we find that

\[
M = 4 \text{ and } k_y = 0 \text{ or } \pi \text{ yield zero eigenvalues. Taking subsequently projections onto } k_x \text{ and } k_y \text{ and using that } M = M - 2B \sum \left( 1 - \cos(k_i) \right), \text{ we thus conclude that in the } \Gamma \text{ phase these } k_x \text{ choices correspond to an inversion at } k = (0,0), \text{ whereas in the } M \text{ phase the inversion is at } k = (\pi,\pi). \text{ We stress that this analysis still holds if we add Rashba terms, which are odd functions of momentum. Similarly, we may add a next-nearest-neighbor term } d_2(k) = -B(1 - \cos(k_x) \cos(k_y))d_x(k) = \cos(k_x) \sin(k_y)d_y(k) = -\sin(k_x) \cos(k_y) \text{ to the Hamiltonian [12], allowing for an additional } X - Y \text{ (p4) topological crystalline phase [11]. This phase is associated with the inversion momenta } k = (\pi,0) \text{ and } k = (0,\pi). \text{ An identical conclusion then shows that instead of } k_y \text{ and } k_x \text{ yield zero eigenvalues of } G_0(\epsilon, k_x, r_\perp) = 0 \text{ for both } k_y = 0 \text{ and } \pi. \text{ These ideas carry over directly to three dimensions. Consider for example a } \Gamma' - (T\cdot pm3m) \text{ phase with an inversion at } k = (0,0,0) \text{ for } 0 < M/B < 4, \text{ in the projected plane one should now choose } k_z = 0 \text{ or on a line } k_z = 0. \text{ Our method allows to distinguish between a } d = 3 \text{ weak and strong topological insulators (TIs) [5]. Since a weak TI can be viewed as a stacking of } d = 2 \text{ TIs, it follows that the codimension-1 local Green’s function with } r_1 \text{ parallel to the } 2D \text{ layers will not have zero eigenvalues.}

Conclusions and outlook. We have shown that topological band insulators can be characterized by the existence of zero eigenvalues in the local in-gap Green’s function

\[
G_0(\epsilon, k_x, r_\perp) = 0, \quad r_\perp \text{ is the position vector perpendicular to a codimension-1 or codimension-2 impurity.} \]

Whereas the codimension-1 impurities can be viewed as soft edges, the nontrivial result for codimension-2 impurities suggests one can experimentally probe the difference between a topological insulator and a trivial insulator using a tunable localized impurity.

We made some simplifying assumptions in the proof presented above, but the results are robust. For example, adding more bands to the system, further away from the Fermi level, might introduce extra impurity bound states whose energies depend strongly on the impurity strength, but one can show that these do not generally remove the states arising from the low-energy bands. Furthermore, we showed (e.g., Fig. 2) the persistence of bound states for strong potentials \( V \); however, while the shape of bound-state energy versus potential strength changes if \( V_0 \) is included, the conclusion that they persist is independent of the ratio \( V_0/V \). Additionally, as long as weak electron-electron interactions do not close the gap or spontaneously break a symmetry, the principle of adiabatic continuation suggests our proposed classification applies equally well to gapped weakly interacting systems with a quasiparticle description [34] or topological superconductors [7].

Acknowledgments. This work is supported by the Dutch Foundation for Fundamental Research on Matter (FOM). L.R. was supported by the Dutch Science Foundation (NWO) through a Rubicon grant. L.B. was supported by the National Science Foundation under Grant No. DMR-12-06809.


085126-5