The handle [http://hdl.handle.net/1887/20181](http://hdl.handle.net/1887/20181) holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

**Author:** Berkel, Tazuko van  
**Title:** The economics of friendship: changing conceptions of reciprocity in classical Athens  
**Date:** 2012-11-27
The Economics of Friendship
Changing conceptions of reciprocity
in Classical Athens

PROEFSCHRIFT

TER VERKRIJGING VAN
DE GRAAD VAN DOCTOR AAN DE UNIVERSITEIT LEIDEN,
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus Prof. Mr. P.F. van der Heijden,
hoogleraar in de faculteit der Rechtsgeleerdheid,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op dinsdag 27 november 2012
klokke 16.15 uur

DOOR

TAZUKO ANGELA VAN BERKEL

GEBOREN TE LEIMUIDEN
IN 1979
Promotiecommissie

promotor Prof. dr. I. Sluiter
Prof. dr. J. Blok (Universiteit Utrecht)

leden Prof. dr. K.A. Algra (Universiteit Utrecht)
Em. prof. dr. N.R.E. Fisher (Cardiff University)
Prof. dr. A.P.M.H. Lardinois (Radboud Universiteit Nijmegen)
Dr. F.G. Naerebout (Universiteit Leiden)
Dr. A.M. Rademaker (Universiteit Leiden)
Em. prof. dr. C. Risseeuw (Universiteit Leiden)
Preface

ALTHOUGH one never really seems to be prepared for the moment something is actually finished, one does occasionally indulge in writing prefaces. I have long been planning to point out the sheer irony of my dissertation topic: “Money and friendship,” I would say in a typically self-deprecatory vein, “whereas in my own life I seem to have neither!” The deeper irony is that it took me years of scholarship to realize that this would not only make my audience feel awkward and perhaps question my mental stability, but that it would also be very ungrateful.

Ingratitude, as I have come to understand, is a failure to acknowledge the truth of a situation—or other, equally relevant, truths of the same situation. It is the inability to see oneself as part of a larger whole. It is the behavior of a Compulsive Grumbler or a Generic PhD-student doomed to see the downside of things, weighed down by the idea that pessimism and cynicism are academic virtues, but momentarily forgetting that it is a privilege to have the opportunity to earn one’s living by exploring the ancient world and to be part of a flourishing and inspiring academic community. Throughout my graduate years I have greatly benefited from being part of this community—as part of a research community in OIKOS, but also as a full colleague and employee at the Leiden Department of Classics endowed with teaching responsibilities. It is uniquely characteristic of the Dutch university system that PhD-students are regarded as employees and I believe this to be an investment in human capital that deserves to be valued as more than an economic liability that can be abolished lightly in times of austerity measures.

In many cultures verbal expressions of gratitude are regarded as shallow substitutes for a deeper sense of obligation. In ancient Greek, however, verbal expressions of thanks are not substitutes for reciprocation, but signs that communicate that generosity and grace are acknowledged and will be
remembered until a suitable occasion for reciprocation arises. They are token
and promise in one. It is in this spirit that I would like to express my gratitude:
to my senior colleagues without whom it would have been impossible to write
this dissertation; to my fellow PhD-students in Leiden and at OIKOS; to the
undergraduate students for being eager to learn but prone to question
everything I try to teach them; to Albert, Casper, Chiara, Christina, Lina and
Lucien for being my sparring partners; to my fellow fellows at NIAS, especially
Arjo, Erik, Jan H. and Joy, for telling me that it is OK to be a classicist and that
my research matters; to my friends; to my “paranymphs” Han and Saskia for
being my brothers in arms; to my family, especially my parents for teaching me
that curiosity is not just a rover on Mars; to Jan, who never stopped being a
kind and generous friend; to Mathilde, for teaching me that sometimes curiosity
is a rover on Mars; to Anne, who was always there for me, who kept the music
in my life and reminded me that it has never been my duty to remake the world
at large.
# Contents

## Introduction

**The Economics of Friendship**

1. Friendship: Money can’t buy it?
2. Φιλία
   2.1. Forms and norms of φιλία-reciprocity
   2.2. The scope and charge of φιλία-vocabulary
   2.3. Objective vs. subjective ties
3. An economic mentality
   3.1. The transformation of the Athenian economy
   3.2. Money and commerce I: against the creation myth of money
   3.3. Money and commerce II: Greek thinking about money
4. Reciprocity
   4.1. Definitions and types of reciprocity
   4.2. Long-term vs. short-term
   4.3. Gifts vs. Commodities
5. Plan of this book

## PART I

**The Analysis of Exchange**

**Chapter One**

**Grace under Pressure. The Anatomy of χάρις**

1. Three cases of isomorphism
   1.1. Case 1: χάρις in erotics, the verbal icing on the cake of vice?
   1.2. Case 2: χάρις in religious communication, a mere name for commerce?
   1.3. Case 3: χάρις in lending and borrowing, an “as if”?
   1.4. The ban on reductionism
2. χάρις and successful interaction
   2.1. Successful interaction between beauty and beholder
   2.2. Successful interaction between giver and recipient
   2.3. The embodiment of χάρις: knowing vs. showing
CONTENTS

3. Perception and méconnaissance 81
   3.1. The puzzle of obligation 81
   3.2. To see and not to see: méconnaissance 84
4. Conflicts and cynicism 93
   4.1. Temporal perspective: balance sheets 95
   4.2. Focalization: cynicism 98
5. Concluding Remarks 101

CHAPTER TWO

PRINCIPLES OF CHARITY
SOME STRATEGIES OF DEMARCATION 103

1. Debt vs. χάρις 108
   1.1 The most binding of obligations 108
   1.2. The law of gratitude 110
2. Cleaning the pebbles or washing them away 115
3. Alternative commerce 119
   3.1. Short- vs. long-term 119
   3.2. The fuzzy mathematics of the long-term 121
4. Necessity vs. χάρις 124
   4.1. Above and beyond the call of duty 124
   4.2. “χάρις abhors intolerable necessity” 129
5. The moral icing on the cake 130
   5.1. Interest-free credit 130
   5.2. Customer relation maintenance 133
6. Indebtedness Engineering and Symbolic Violence 134
   6.1. Irredeemable χάρις and χάρις gone bad 134
   6.2. Symbolic violence 138
   6.3. The misrecognition of power 140
7. Concluding Remarks 144

CHAPTER THREE

NOT FOR SALE? ARISTOTLE ON RECIPROCITY 147

1. Utility friendship 151
   1.1. Deficiency, need and utility 151
   1.2. Mutual exploitation or mutual benefit? 155
   1.3. The consequences of isomorphism 160
CONTENTS

2. The Debtor Paradigm of Obligation 161
   2.1. The analytical use of isomorphism 161
   2.2. Problems of perspective 164

3. Constructing the informal 168
   3.1. Law vs. moral character in Aristotle 168
   3.2. Character-based utility friendship: a hybrid or perspective problem? 173

4. The problem of measurement 179
   4.1. Money as a common measure: Aristotle’s theory of value 179
   4.2. Means and ends 185
   4.3. The incommensurability of utility, pleasure and virtue 187
   4.4. Subjectivity and value formation 190

5. Preserving incommensurability 193
   5.1. The incommensurability of τιμή and utility 193
   5.2. Symbolic economy 195

6. Concluding remarks 199

PART II
The Morality of Exchange

CHAPTER FOUR
PRICING THE INVALUABLE.
SOCRATES AND THE VALUE OF FRIENDSHIP 203

1. Framing Socratic Conversation 204
   1.1. Socrates versus Antiphon 204
   1.2. Some notes on the commodification of wisdom and virtue 211

2. Friendship and the Discourse of Commerce 212

3. Redefining Value and Utility 215
   3.1 Utility and use: ancient and modern conceptualizations 215
   3.2 The Socratic conception of utility and use 217

4. Commerce vs. Estate Management 221
   4.1. Beyond the egoism/altruism debate 221
   4.2. Estate management 222
   4.3. Unfit friends 224
   4.4. ἐγκράτεια 225
   4.5. Heracles’ choice 228
## CONTENTS

5. Concluding Remarks 231

### CHAPTER FIVE

**ACTIVE PARTNERSHIP.
SOCRATES AND THE ART OF SEDUCTION** 233

1. The Socratic Principle: pay it forward 236
2. Amazing Grace: looking as a reciprocal endeavor 240
   2.1. The look of love: χάρις and display 240
   2.2. Erotic χάρις 244
   2.3. Hetaeras and prostitutes 249
3. The hunter hunted: role reversals and the paradox of the hetaera 254
   3.1. Hunting without violence 254
   3.2. *Mem.* II.vi: hunting “friends” 256
   3.3. Who is hunting whom? 259
   3.4. The hunting sophist: a didactic turn 260
4. Desire management 264
   4.1. Beneath the veil of words 264
   4.2. Playing hard to get: χάρις deflated 269
5. The secrets of Love Magic 272
   5.1. Socrates the co-hunter 272
   5.2. *Mem.* II.iii and II.vi: Love Magic 276
   5.3. Playing hard to get vs. Love Magic 279
6. Concluding remarks 281

### EPILOGUE

1. “It works both ways”: constructions of the market 288
2. Emotion management 291

### BIBLIOGRAPHY

297

### SAMENVATTING

335

### CURRICULUM VITAE

344