

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/20072> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

**Author:** Laffoon, Jason Eric

**Title:** Patterns of paleomobility in the ancient Antilles : an isotopic approach

**Issue Date:** 2012-10-31

**PATTERNS OF PALEOMOBILITY IN THE ANCIENT ANTILLES**

*AN ISOTOPIC APPROACH*

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van  
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,  
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. Mr. P.F. van der Heijden,  
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties  
te verdedigen op woensdag 31 oktober 2012  
klokke 13.45 uur

door  
Jason Eric Laffoon  
geboren te Waukegan, U.S.A  
in 1974

**Promotiecommissie**

Promotor: Prof. Dr. Corinne L. Hofman

Promotor: Prof. Dr. Gareth R. Davies

Co-promotor: Dr. Menno Hoogland

Overige leden: Prof. Dr. Hans van der Plicht, Universiteit Leiden

Prof. Dr. T. Douglas Price, University of Wisconsin-Madison

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Throughout the course of the research presented here, I have benefited immensely from the assistance, advice and support of numerous institutions, colleagues and friends. I wish to express my deepest gratitude to everyone that helped to make this research possible and without whom this work could not have been accomplished. I would like to start by thanking the people of the Caribbean, past and present, whose heritage and history is the focus and inspiration for this study.

I am deeply indebted to and thankful for the input, advice, motivation, encouragement, and intellectual support of my supervisors: Professor Corinne L. Hofman, Professor Gareth R. Davies, and Dr. Menno L.P. Hoogland. Professors Hofman and Hoogland not only can be credited with initiating the research that led to the study presented herein but they also supervised most aspects of this project and fully supported this research in every way. Their long-held interest in, and commitment to, the study of mobility and exchange in the prehistoric Caribbean forms the basis of this present work. Furthermore, my research project represents only one component of a much larger international and inter-disciplinary research programme, entitled 'Communicating Communities in the Circum-Caribbean', financially supported by an NWO-funded grant (VICI-project no. 277-62-001) awarded to and under the supervision of Prof. Corinne Hofman. I am extremely grateful to Prof. Gareth Davies not only for supervising the analytical components of this research but also for his help, guidance, and direction concerning various aspects of isotope analyses. All three of my supervisors also patiently read and reread many earlier drafts and versions of this dissertation and provided invaluable feedback for which I am extremely grateful. I would also like to expressly acknowledge the Netherlands Organization for Scientific Research (NWO) for the financial support that made this research possible. In addition, I am also very thankful for the assistance and support of the Faculty of Archaeology at Leiden University.

In addition, I would also like to take this opportunity to thank the Department of Anthropology at the University of Illinois-Chicago (UIC) and my former colleagues and

professors there who taught, guided, and encouraged me throughout my undergraduate and early graduate studies. I would like to particularly express my gratitude to Cameron Wesson who gave me my first opportunity to do archaeological fieldwork and who encouraged me to follow my dream to become an archaeologist. I am also thankful for the support and guidance of many other professors at UIC who contributed in various ways to my academic and professional development especially Kathy Rizzo, Lawrence Keeley, Joel Palka, Sloan Williams, Anna Roosevelt, and Ryan Williams. I would like to express my sincerest gratitude to Antonio Curet who introduced me to Caribbean archaeology and kindly gave me my first opportunity to do archaeological research in the region, who guided and supported me throughout my studies at UIC, and without whom I would not be where I am today.

During the course of this work, I had the wonderful opportunity to visit many of the islands of the Caribbean in the process of collecting samples. These trips provided invaluable experience in terms of getting acquainted with the different islands and their highly variable natural and cultural settings. Traveling between the islands also provided me with personal experience and perspective on the spatial distances and scale of the region and some of the associated logistical difficulties that can arise with inter-island transportation in such settings. Nonetheless, innumerable institutions and people assisted me during the course of this work and I wish to specifically acknowledge them here and hope that if I forget anyone they will credit it to a lack of memory as opposed to a lack of gratitude. First and foremost, I thank Menno Hoogland who directed much of the sampling and directly or indirectly obtained many of the samples analyzed for this research. I was extremely fortunate that Menno was passionate about my work and I was happily surprised that much of the sample collection and processing was already underway when I began my work for this study. I would also like to specifically thank Peter Siegel and Mice Roca, Marc Dorst, Kathy Martin, Eric Branford, Elizabeth Righter, Raymundo Dijkhoff, Glenis Tavaréz, Reg and Nicky Murphy, Peter O'Brien Harris, Lennox Honychurch, John Crock, Irv Quitmyer, Jay Havisier, Sandrine Grouard, Henri Marchesi, Christian Stouvenot, Dominique Bonnissent, Thomas Romon, James Burton and T. Douglas Price for providing samples, access to sample collections, and/or assistance with the sampling process. Many institutions also generously provided access

to sample collections and materials including the Florida Museum of Natural History; The National Archaeological Museum Aruba; the Saint Lucia Archaeological and Historical Society; the St. Vincent and the Grenadines National Trust; the University of the West Indies, St. Augustine, Trinidad and Tobago; the University of the West Indies, Cave Hill, Barbados; the Field Research Centre, Antigua; El Museo del Hombre Dominicano, Dominican Republic; El Departamento Centro Oriental de Arqueología and Museo El Chorro de Maíta, Cuba. In this regard, I also greatly benefited from the assistance of many friends and colleagues at Leiden University including Arie Boomert, Angus Mol, Hayley Mickleburgh, Rachel Schats, Anne van Duijvenbode, Alice Samson, Ryan Espersen, Samantha de Ruiten, Jorge Ulloa Hung, Roberto Valcárcel Rojas, Yann Hoogland and dozens of students who contributed to this research in many ways and for which I am extremely grateful.

During the course of conducting research at the facilities of the Faculty of Earth and Life Sciences, Free University Amsterdam (VU) I conducted isotope analyzes of several hundred samples. However, it is important to acknowledge that I received a great deal of assistance with sample preparation, processing, and measurement. First and foremost, this research builds on earlier work carried out by several students, analysts and research assistants including Hylke de Jong, Mathijs Booden, Marin Waaijer, and Hayley Mickleburgh who previously analyzed several dozen samples in the context of pilot projects under the supervision of Gareth Davies, Menno Hoogland and Corinne Hofman. My research project has built upon and incorporated the preliminary results of these projects. In addition, I am forever indebted to Richard Smeets who trained me in many of the various laboratory protocols and procedures required for strontium isotope analyses and who was infinitely patient with my many questions concerning isotope chemistry. Thanks are also owed to Laura Font, Martijn Klaver and Lisette Kootker both for the technical assistance with mass spectrometry and more importantly for many interesting and stimulating discussions concerning various aspects of isotope research. I am also thankful for the assistance of Lidewij Radix, Bart de Vos and Esther Plomp who helped me with sample preparing and processing samples on many occasions. I would also like to thank Bas van der Wagt for measuring the elemental concentrations of my samples and

for his much needed help interpreting these data. Lastly, I also thank Suzan Verdegal and Hubert Vonhof for conducting the carbon and oxygen isotope measurements for me.

On both a professional and personal level, I would like to express my gratitude and appreciation to all the colleagues and friends who provided me support of every kind throughout the course of my research. At Leiden, I am especially forever grateful for the friendship and support of Angus Mol, Hayley Mickleburgh, Jimmy Mans, Alice Samson, Daan Isendoorn and Alistair Bright. Further abroad, I would like to specifically thank Will Pestle, Joshua Torres, and Reniel Rodríguez Ramos from whom I have learned much and who were always very supportive of me and my research. Special thanks are also owed to Pepijn van der Linden for designing the cover, and Menno Hoogland and Clément Bataille for providing many of the maps and figures included in this work.

On a more personal note, I would like to thank my family for all of their love and support over the years. I am especially thankful to my mother and father who have always encouraged me in all of my endeavors and dreams know matter how fantastical they must have seemed (or still do). To Noortje, for your patience and understanding throughout this entire process, I thank you and I love you. Finally, I dedicate this dissertation to my son Sam whose timely arrival provided me with some much needed perspective on the really important things in life.

**For Sam**





## TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1	INTRODUCTION .....	1
1.1	Introduction .....	1
1.2	Research Problem Statement .....	3
1.3	Research Project Description.....	5
1.4	Organization of the Dissertation.....	8
CHAPTER 2	MIGRATION STUDIES IN ARCHAEOLOGY .....	13
2.1	Introduction .....	13
2.2	Archaeological Approaches to Migration.....	13
2.2.1	Critical Assessment of Irving Rouse’s Contributions to Migrations Studies.....	18
2.3	Anthropological Insights into Migration Processes and Patterns .....	20
2.3.1	Defining Migration (What is Migration?).....	20
2.3.2	Types of Migration (Scale, Distance, and Boundaries) .....	23
2.3.3	Migrants and Migrant Groups (Who migrates?).....	28
2.3.4	Reasons, Causes, and Models (Why do people migrate?) .....	31
2.3.5	Destinations (Where do people migrate?).....	33
2.3.6	Impacts and Consequences of Migration .....	37
2.4	Migration Research in Caribbean Archaeology.....	40
CHAPTER 3	ISOTOPE ARCHAEOLOGY .....	47
3.1	Introduction .....	47
3.2	Strontium Isotopes.....	48
3.2.1	Strontium Isotopes in Natural Systems.....	49
3.2.2	Strontium Isotopes- Geology .....	49
3.2.3	Strontium Isotopes- Hydrology.....	50
3.2.4	Strontium Isotopes- Atmosphere .....	52
3.2.5	Strontium Isotope Ecology.....	53
3.2.6	Strontium Isotopes- Biology.....	55
3.3	Strontium Isotopes- Archaeology .....	58
3.3.1	History of Sr Isotope Research in Archaeology.....	58
3.3.2	Determining the Local Sr Isotope Signature.....	59
3.3.3	Complications and Limitations of Strontium Isotope Analysis .....	62
3.3.4	Archaeological Applications of Sr Isotope Analysis to Human Migrations.....	67
3.3.5	Other Applications of Sr Isotope Analyses.....	69
3.4	Stable Isotopes .....	71
3.4.1	Carbon Isotopes .....	72
3.4.2	Oxygen Isotopes.....	73
3.5	Summary.....	76

CHAPTER 4	METHODS AND TECHNIQUES .....	77
4.2	Sample Collection Strategies.....	77
4.2.1	Collection of Faunal and Botanical Samples .....	78
4.2.2	Collection of Human Dental Samples.....	83
4.3	Strontium Isotope Analyses: Sample Processing .....	84
4.4	TIMS - Thermal Ionization Mass Spectrometry.....	88
4.4.1	TIMS - Filaments.....	89
4.4.2	Loading Samples .....	90
4.4.3	TIMS – Operating Parameters .....	91
4.4.4	TIMS – Standards .....	92
4.4.5	TIMS – Blanks.....	93
4.5	Carbon and Oxygen Isotope Analyses.....	93
CHAPTER 5	MATERIALS, SITES AND SETTINGS .....	95
5.1	Introduction .....	95
5.2	Geographic Context of Study Area.....	95
5.3	Site Settings and Skeletal Assemblages.....	99
5.3.1	El Chorro de Maíta- Cuba.....	102
5.3.2	Punta Macao and El Cabo- Dominican Republic .....	105
5.3.3	Maisabel- Puerto Rico.....	108
5.3.4	Tutu- St. Thomas, U.S. Virgin Islands.....	110
5.3.5	Kelbey’s Ridge 2 and Spring Bay 1c- Saba.....	113
5.3.6	Bloody Point- St. Kitts.....	115
5.3.7	Anse à la Gourde- Guadeloupe .....	116
5.3.8	Lavoutte and Giraudy- St. Lucia.....	119
5.3.9	Escape, Argyle I, Argyle II, and Buccament West- St. Vincent .....	121
5.3.10	Heywoods- Barbados .....	123
5.3.11	Manzanilla- Trinidad.....	124
5.3.12	Malmok, Canashito, Santa Cruz, Savaneta, and Tanki Flip- Aruba .....	126
5.4	Summary.....	128
CHAPTER 6	RESULTS.....	131
6.1	Introduction .....	131
6.2	Biosphere Strontium Isotope Results.....	131
6.3	Human Strontium Isotope Results .....	141
6.3.1	El Chorro de Maíta, Cueva de los Muertos, and Porteño del Mango- Cuba .....	148
6.3.2	Punta Macao, El Cabo and Bartolo- Dominican Republic.....	150
6.3.3	Maisabel- Puerto Rico.....	152
6.3.4	Tutu- St. Thomas, U.S. Virgin Islands.....	154
6.3.5	Kelbey’s Ridge 2 and Spring Bay 1c- Saba.....	155
6.3.6	Bloody Point- St. Kitts.....	156
6.3.7	Anse à la Gourde- Guadeloupe .....	158
6.3.8	Lavoutte and Giraudy- St. Lucia.....	159
6.3.9	Escape, Argyle I, Argyle II, and Buccament West- St. Vincent .....	161
6.3.10	Heywoods- Barbados .....	162
6.3.11	Manzanilla- Trinidad.....	163

6.3.12	Malmok, Canashito, Santa Cruz, Savaneta, and Tanki Flip- Aruba	165
6.4	Human Oxygen and Carbon Isotope Results	167
6.4.1	Oxygen Isotope Results	169
6.4.2	Carbon Isotope Results	171
6.5	Summary of Results	173
CHAPTER 7	DISCUSSION	174
7.1	Introduction	174
7.2	Spatial Variability of Biosphere $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ in the Caribbean	174
7.2	Interpreting Human Strontium Isotope Results	180
7.2.1	Comparison of different methods for estimating local Sr isotope ranges	180
7.2.2	Methods applied to the identification of nonlocal humans	182
7.3	Local $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ Range Estimates and Nonlocal Individuals	183
7.3.1	El Chorro de Maíta, Cueva de los Muertos, and Porteño del Mango- Cuba	186
7.3.2	Punta Macao and El Cabo- Dominican Republic	188
7.3.3	Maisabel- Puerto Rico	191
7.3.4	Tutu- St. Thomas, U.S. Virgin Islands	193
7.3.5	Kelbey's Ridge 2 and Spring Bay- Saba	195
7.3.6	Bloody Point- St. Kitts	196
7.3.7	Anse à la Gourde- Guadeloupe	197
7.3.8	Lavoutte and Giraudy- St. Lucia	199
7.3.9	Escape, Argyle I and II, and Buccament West- St. Vincent	201
7.3.10	Heywoods- Barbados	204
7.3.11	Manzanilla- Trinidad	204
7.3.12	Malmok, Ceru Canashito, Santa Cruz, Savaneta, and Tanki Flip- Aruba	206
7.4	Patterns of Paleomobility	208
7.4.1	Patterns of Paleomobility: biological sex	208
7.4.2	Patterns of Paleomobility: age at death	213
7.4.3	Patterns of Paleomobility: chronology	217
7.4.4	Patterns of Paleomobility: grave goods	219
7.4.5	Patterns of Paleomobility: dietary patterns	221
7.5	Assessing Human Dental Enamel Carbon and Oxygen Isotope Results	230
7.6	Characterizing Caribbean Paleomobility	239
CHAPTER 8	CONCLUSIONS	242
8.1	Introduction	242
8.2	Biosphere Strontium Isotope Variation in the Caribbean	242
8.3	Human Strontium Isotope Variation in the Caribbean	243
8.4	Residential Origins and Biological Sex	244
8.5	Residential Origins and Age at Death	247
8.6	Residential Origins and Chronological Age	249
8.7	Residential Origins and Grave Goods	251
8.8	Residential Origins and Dietary Practices	253
8.9	Multiple Isotopes and Individual Origins	255

8.10	Summary and Implications of Main Findings .....	257
8.11	Methodological Assessment .....	261
8.12	Future Research Directions.....	263
REFERENCES CITED .....		266
SUMMARY .....		318
SAMENVATTING.....		318
APPENDICES .....		326
CURRICULUM VITAE .....		344

## LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Site settings and chronologies.....	99
Table 2: Statistical summary of biosphere $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ data from the Caribbean .....	133
Table 3: Statistical summary of biosphere $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ data by geological subregion.....	136
Table 4: Results of Student <i>t</i> -test comparing mean biosphere $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ ratios of different geological subregions in the Caribbean .....	136
Table 5: Statistical summary of human $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ data by island .....	144
Table 6: Statistical summary of human $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ data by site .....	146
Table 7: Statistical summary of enamel carbon and oxygen isotope data by site .....	169
Table 8: Summary of nonlocals for the largest populations included in this study .....	184
Table 9: Descriptive statistics of the ‘local’ human $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ data. ....	186
Table 10: Comparisons between locality and biological sex .....	211
Table 11: Comparisons between locality and age at death .....	215
Table 12: Comparisons between locality and paleodiet for 3 Caribbean populations ....	227
Table 13: Summary of enamel $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ data from Caribbean populations.....	231
Table 14: Appendix A – Biosphere sample information and strontium isotope results..	326
Table 15: Appendix B –Human sample information and strontium isotope results .....	333
Table 16: Appendix C –Human carbon and oxygen isotope results .....	342

## LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1	Map of the Caribbean Region. ....	97
Figure 2	Map of the Lesser Antilles. ....	98
Figure 3	Map of the Caribbean with the location of sites included in this study. ....	101
Figure 4	Relative probability diagram and histogram of biosphere $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ data. ....	132
Figure 5	Map of the Caribbean with mean biosphere $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ per island/region. ....	134
Figure 6	Boxplot of biosphere $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ data by island/region. ....	135
Figure 7	Boxplot of biosphere $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ variation by geological subregion. ....	137
Figure 8	Relative probability diagram and histogram of human $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ data. ....	142
Figure 9	Map of the Caribbean displaying mean human $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ per island. ....	143
Figure 10	Boxplot of human $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ data by island. ....	145
Figure 11	Boxplot of human $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ data by site. ....	147
Figure 12	Boxplot comparing biosphere and human $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ data. ....	148
Figure 13	Strontium Isotope Ratios- Cuba. ....	150
Figure 14	Strontium Isotope Ratios- Dominican Republic. ....	152
Figure 15	Strontium Isotope Ratios- Puerto Rico. ....	153
Figure 16	Strontium Isotope Ratios- St. Thomas. ....	155
Figure 17	Strontium Isotope Ratios- Saba. ....	156
Figure 18	Strontium Isotope Ratios- St. Kitts. ....	158
Figure 19	Strontium Isotope Ratios- Grande-Terre, Guadeloupe. ....	159
Figure 20	Strontium Isotope Ratios- St. Lucia. ....	160
Figure 21	Strontium Isotope Ratios- St. Vincent. ....	162
Figure 22	Strontium Isotope Ratios- Barbados. ....	163
Figure 23	Strontium Isotope Ratios- Trinidad. ....	165
Figure 24	Strontium Isotope Ratios- Aruba. ....	167
Figure 25	Map of the Caribbean displaying mean human $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ per island. ....	168
Figure 26	Map of the Caribbean displaying mean human $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ per island. ....	168
Figure 27	Diagram of human enamel $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{ca}}$ and $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ data from this study. ....	171
Figure 28	Diagram of human enamel $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{ca}}$ and $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ data from this study. ....	172
Figure 29	Diagram of human enamel $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{ca}}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{ca}}$ data from this study. ....	173
Figure 30	Map of modeled biosphere $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ variation in the Circum-Caribbean. ....	178
Figure 31	Map of modeled biosphere $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ variation in the Eastern Caribbean. ....	179
Figure 32	Histograms with normal distribution curves of human $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ data. ....	185
Figure 33	Normal probability Q-Q plot of human $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ data- Chorro de Maíta. ....	188
Figure 34	Normal probability Q-Q plot of human $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ data- Punta Macao. ....	191
Figure 35	Normal probability Q-Q plot of human $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ data- Maisabel. ....	193
Figure 36	Normal probability Q-Q plot of human $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ data- Tutu. ....	195
Figure 37	Normal probability Q-Q plot of human $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ data- Anse à la Gourde. ....	199
Figure 38	Normal probability Q-Q plot of human $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ data- Lavoutte. ....	201
Figure 39	Normal probability Q-Q plot of human $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ data- Escape/Argyle. ....	203
Figure 40	Normal probability Q-Q plot of human $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ data from Manzanilla. ....	206
Figure 41	Charts of patterns between locality and biological sex: ....	212
Figure 42	Chart of patterns between locality and age at death. ....	216

LIST OF FIGURES - continued

Figure 43	Diagrams of bone $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ data from 3 populations in this study....	228
Figure 44	Diagrams of bone $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ data from Caribbean populations.....	229
Figure 45	Diagrams of enamel $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ , $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{ca}}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{ca}}$ data. ....	235
Figure 46	Diagram of enamel $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{ca}}$ data. ....	236



