Muslim Opposition to Logic and Theology in the Light of the Works of Jalāl al-Dīn al-Suyūṭī (d. 911/1505)
Muslim Opposition to Logic and Theology in the Light of the Works of Jalāl al-Dīn al-Suyūṭī (d. 911/1505)

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. P.F. van der Heijden,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op dinsdag 4 november 2008
klokke 10:00 uur

door
Mufti Ali
Geboren te Serang (Banten), Indonesië
in 1972
Promotiecommissie

Promotor: Prof. dr. P. S. van Koningsveld
Referent: Prof. dr. H. Daiber
Overige leden: Dr. M. Ghaly
Prof. dr. M.S. Berger
Prof. dr. R. Kruk
Tanda kenangan
untuk yang tercinta
dan tersayang
Anita,
Mehrunnisa, dan
Mahira Mujahida
# Table of Content

Preface........................................................................................................................ v  
Acknowledgements........................................................................................................ vi  
Abbreviations................................................................................................................ viii  

## Introduction
Modern Theories on the Origin of Islamic Theology........................................... 1  
Modern Views on Islamic Opposition to Logic and Theology.......................... 14  
al-Suyūṭī’s Position.............................................................................................. 28  
The Scope of the Present work........................................................................... 33  

### Chapter One

**al-Qawl al-Mushriq fī Tahrīm al-Ishtīqāl bi ‘Ilm al-Manṭiq**: Its Manuscripts, the Date and Purpose of its Composition as well as its Content and Sources........................................................................................................... 34  
1.1. The manuscripts......................................................................................... 34  
1.2. The Date and Purpose of the Composition of QM............................... 34  
1.3. The Content............................................................................................... 35  
1.4. Conclusion: Evaluation of QM as a source for the history of the opposition against logic................................................................. 60  

### Chapter Two

**Jahd al-Qariha fī Tajrid al-Nasiha**: al-Suyūṭī’s Abridgement of Ibn Taymiyya’s *Nasiḥat Ahl al-Imān fī al-Radd ‘alā Maṭṭiq al-Yūnūn*................. 67  
2.1. The Date and Purpose of Abridgement of Nasiha.................................. 67  
2.2. The Contribution Made by al-Suyūṭī in Presenting IT’s Arguments more Comprehensibly............................................................... 67  
2.3. Elements of IT’s Religious Viewpoints Against Logic and Theology in JQ...................................................................................... 68  
2.4. How did al-Suyūṭī select IT’s viewpoints against logic in this abridgement?.................................................................................. 73  
2.5. The rationale of al-Suyūṭī’s selection of IT’s arguments in JQ............. 78  

### Chapter Three

**Ṣawān al-Manṭiq wa ’l-Kalām ‘an Fannay al-Manṭiq wa ’l-Kalām**: Its Manuscript, the Date and Purpose of its Composition as well as its Content and Sources................................................................. 80  
3.1. Manuscript and Edition of SM................................................................ 80  
3.2. Date of Composition of SM.................................................................... 83  
3.3. Background and Purpose of the Composition of SM............................ 84  
3.4. The Contents of SM................................................................................ 85  
3.5. Conclusion................................................................................................. 144  

### Chapter Four

Al-Suyūṭī’s *Fatwā* against Logic: Its Manuscript and its Content as well as its Source........................................................................................................... 153  
4.1. The Manuscript of the *Fatwā*................................................................. 153  
4.2. The Content of the *Fatwā*................................................................... 153  
4.3. Evaluation of the sources...................................................................... 158  

### Chapter Five

Conclusion............................................................................................................. 160  
5.1. QM, JQ, SM and the *Fatwā* as Sources for the History of the...... 160
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Opposition to Logic and Theology</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2. Prosopographical Data against Logic in the Works of al-Suyūṭī</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3. Al-Suyūṭī’s Changing Views on al-Shāfīʿi, al-Gazālī and al-Juwaynī</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in QM, JQ, SM and the Fatwā</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Samenvatting</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum Vitae</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Preface

Well-known place names and terms, for instance Mecca, Madina, Jerusalem, Damascus, Bagdad, Islam, Sunna, Koran are transcribed in their English spellings. Less common place names are transliterated. Technical terms are translated whereever possible, but those such as *umma, fatwā, shari‘a, kalām, shaykh, ḥāfiz, āthar, taṣawwuf* and *ḥabar* are retained in their Arabic form.

With the exception of page 67-79, the words in square brackets represent my own insertions. I also used parentheses for equivalent Arabic terms taken from al-Suyūṭī’s texts.

For the Koranic verses cited, I have constantly depended on Bell’s translation. In cases where the Koranic verse is not completely quoted by the author, the completion based also on Bell’s translation is given in the notes when it appeared necessary for the understanding of the text. When identifying individuals mentioned in al-Suyūṭī texts, I have sometimes also used notes of the first edition of SM and those of SU, when I deemed it necessary. These I marked respectively with the letters N (for al-Nashshār, the editor of SM) and H (for Ḥamdān, the editor of SU).

The transliteration system that I follow is:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Arabic Letter</th>
<th>English Equivalent</th>
<th>Long Vowels</th>
<th>Diphthongs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ب</td>
<td>b</td>
<td>َب</td>
<td>َب</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ت</td>
<td>t</td>
<td>َت</td>
<td>َت</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ض</td>
<td>d</td>
<td>َض</td>
<td>َض</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ح</td>
<td>h</td>
<td>َح</td>
<td>َح</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ز</td>
<td>z</td>
<td>َز</td>
<td>َز</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>س</td>
<td>s</td>
<td>َس</td>
<td>َس</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ش</td>
<td>sh</td>
<td>َش</td>
<td>َش</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ض</td>
<td>s</td>
<td>َض</td>
<td>َض</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ط</td>
<td>t</td>
<td>َط</td>
<td>َط</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ظ</td>
<td>z</td>
<td>َظ</td>
<td>َظ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ع</td>
<td>u</td>
<td>َع</td>
<td>َع</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ن</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>َن</td>
<td>َن</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>م</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>َم</td>
<td>َم</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>و</td>
<td>w</td>
<td>َو</td>
<td>َو</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>َ</td>
<td>َ</td>
<td>َ</td>
<td>َ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ء</td>
<td>e</td>
<td>َء</td>
<td>َء</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ِ</td>
<td>ِ</td>
<td>ِ</td>
<td>ِ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ْ</td>
<td>ْ</td>
<td>ْ</td>
<td>ْ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ش</td>
<td>sh</td>
<td>َش</td>
<td>َش</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>خ</td>
<td>kh</td>
<td>َخ</td>
<td>َخ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ج</td>
<td>g</td>
<td>َج</td>
<td>َج</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>د</td>
<td>d</td>
<td>َد</td>
<td>َد</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ذ</td>
<td>dz</td>
<td>َذ</td>
<td>َذ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ر</td>
<td>r</td>
<td>َر</td>
<td>َر</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

vii
Acknowledgements

First of all, my departure to the Netherlands in November 2001 would not have been possible without the official permission of Prof. Dr. H.M.A. Tihami, M.A., the Rector of the State Institute for Islamic Studies (IAIN) ‘Sultan Maulana Hasanuddin Banten’ and without my wife’s sacrifice to be left by her husband to take care of our beloved daughters, Mehr and Mahira with the assistance of my beloved mother, Hj. Siti Aminah and my respectable parents-in-law, H. Ailih Ajalih and Hj. Oniwati.

This research was made possible thanks to the financial support of INIS (Indonesian Netherlands Cooperation in Islamic Studies). At INIS, I sincerely thank Prof. Dr. W.A.L. Stokhof, Dr. N.J.G. Kaptein, Dijk van der Meij, Jantien Delwel, Marise van Amersfoort, and Josien Stremmelaar.

When dealing with the rich oriental collections and abundant research references in the Leiden University Library, I was always helpfully assisted by its staff. Arabic manuscripts from Cairo, Damascus, Dublin and Berlin were rendered accessible to me through the assistance of Dr. Nursamad Kamba (the Indonesian Educational Attaché of the Indonesian Embassy in Cairo), Ust. Farouk, Madame Usaima and Mrs. Kim Duistermaat (Damascus), Carla William (Dublin), and Dr. Hans Kurio (Berlin).

Let me also express my special gratitude to Mr. Drs. Ed Walbeehm, my landlord, who made me familiar with social-cultural life of the people in Leiden and whose help was indispensable. Many thanks are also due to the Family of Eman Sulaeman Yasin in The Hague and to Pak Timur Pradopo in Jakarta. My brothers and sisters: Siti Solehah, Siti Hasanah, Siti Aisah, Muhdi, Mukhlis, Mumin Muaddib, Mansur, Khudri, Andi also deserve to be mentioned here.

My early love for the study of Arabic was instilled by my beloved and reverend father, the late Aslihuddin (d. 1993) who already taught me sarf and nahw when I was ten. His patient and stimulating Arabic lessons enabled me to memorize al-ÝawÁmil and al-Ájurumiyya (basic texts for Arabic grammar commonly used in Indonesian Religious Schools) when I was thirteen. His difficulties in understanding al-WaraqÁt fÐ UÒÙl al-Fiqh by AbÙ al-MaÝÁlÐ al-JuwaynÐ, due to which he spent almost half of his life learning Arabic, in one way or another, motivated me to make an attempt at ‘conquering’ its complexities as well. My understanding of the advanced level of Arabic grammar was made possible thanks to the fatherly guidance of K.H. Bahruddin Afif and the late Drs. H. Tohir Sariq. Classical Arabic became a spoken language to me with the assistance of Ust. Ahmad Ardani, Mahsun, Suwondo, Murtadla, Anwar Mukassah, and others.

My interest in Islamic Studies was instigated by my teacher in Junior High School, the devoted Drs. Ade Mahmuddin whose inspiring lessons brought to my knowledge celebrated figures such as JamÁl al-DÐn al-AfgÁnÐ, MuÎammad ÝAbduh, RashÐd RiÃa, Shakib Arselan, etc, the knowledge of whose ‘relation’ with classical Islam became clearer only six years later thanks to Dr. Saeful Anwar, my academic supervisor in IAIN, who always opened his house to satisfy my curiosity regarding al-GazÁlÐ, al-ÍallÁj, al-JuwaynÐ, Ibn Taymiyya, NiÛÁm al-Mulk and the modern sources dealing with them. The latter’s drawing my attention to the works of the orientalists, such as L. Massignon, I. Goldziher, G.H.A. Juynboll,
Snouck Hurgronje, W.B. Hallaq, and others provided me with the ‘inner energy’ to learn several European languages.

My understanding of some French, Dutch and German sources would not have been possible without the work of my language teachers, affiliated to the Goethe-Institut Rotterdam and Murnau (Munich), the AllianceFrançaise The Hague and the Regional Opleiding Centrum (ROC, Leiden). Their systematic teachings helped me to learn French, Dutch and German.

My discussions with several individuals in Indonesia also helped me to continue my study in the Netherlands: Prof. K.H. Wahab Afif, MA, Drs. Huriyyudin Humaidi, my uncles, Abdul Aziz, MA and Kabir Rifa’i, Ir. Pram Rahmat, Dr. H. Ilzamuddin Ma’mur, MA, Drs. H. Zakaria, M.Pd, Prof. Dr. H. Utang Ranuwijaya, the late Drs. K.H. Mutawali Waladi, Prof. Dr. H. Fauzul Iman, Drs. H. Syibli Sarjaya, L.M.L., Drs. Habudin, Hudairi, Kak Uus, Kak Mahyudi, and others. Colleagues Hafid Asad, Beben, Wowo Suharyono, Imam Muslih, Maman, Aria, Imam Masruhi, the late ust. Hashim, Kak Iik, Buhari, Arifin, Hidayatullah, Hasan Basri, Soni Ahdiat, and others are also worthy of being mentioned here.

My friends in the ‘Laboratorium Bantenologi’ and the ‘Banten Heritage’ should also be mentioned here, respectively: Helmi, Ade, Ayat, Ibnu, Yanwar, Asti, Kak Ali Fadilah, Mas Budi, Nely, Dadan, Ruby. Some individuals and my colleagues in Leiden, Dato’ Prof. Dr. Saleh Yapaar, Prof. Dr. Haron Daod, Dr. Teuku Iskandar, Zulkifli, Nur Ichwan, Amr, Ghaly, Anwar, Didin, Euis, Muslih, Arif Subhan, Jajat, Dahlan, Euis, Mbak Yuni Ch., Suryadi, Noerhaidi, Mujiburahman, Bunyan, Tonang, Johny Tjia, and Syaifudin Zuhri deserve my gratitude.

My zeal for learning will never be satisfied, even if ‘the collection of the UB’ would be transferred to my hometown in Banten. What I have been attempting to do forms only a single footnote to the rich oriental collections and the studies undertaken by the scholars of both the Western and the Muslim World.

Mufti Ali,
Leiden 2008
Abbreviations

ASP: Arabic Sciences and Philosophy
AEL: Arabic-English Lexicon
BO: Bibliotheca Orientalis
BSOAS: Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Study
BW: Bugyat al-Wū’āt fī Ṭabaqāt al-Lugawiyyin wa l-Nuḥāt
DK: al-Durar al-Kāmina fī A’yān al-Mī’a al-Thāmina
DL: al-Daw’ al-Lāmi’ lī Ahl al-Qarn al-Tāsi’
DhK: Dhamm al-Kalām wa Ahlih
DTH: Kitāb al-Dhayl ‘alā Ṭabaqāt al-Ḥanābila
EI¹: the Encyclopaedia of Islam, the first edition
EI²: the Encyclopaedia of Islam, the new edition
EQ: the Encyclopaedia of the Qur’ān
FW: Fawāt al-Wafayāt
GAL: Geschichte die Arabischen Literatur
GAS: Geschichte des Arabischen Schriftum
HM: Ḥusn al-Muhādara fī Aḥbār Miṣr wa l-Qāhira
IAH: Al-Ittiṣār lī Ahl al-Hadīth
IJMES: International Journal for Middle Eastern Studies
ILS: Islamic Law and Society
IS: Islamic Studies
IT: Ibn Taymiyya
IU: Iḥyā’ ‘Ulūm al-Dīn
JB: Jāmi‘ Bayān al-ÝIlm wa Faålīh
JQ: Jahd al-Qarīha fī Tajrīd al-Nāṣiḥa
JIS: Journal of Islamic Studies
JRAS: Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society
KA: al-Kunyā wa l’Ansāb
KWS: al-Kawākīb al-Sā’ira bi A’yān al-Mī’a al-‘Aṣhīra
MB: Manāḥij al-Baḥth ‘ind Muṭākkirī l’-Īlām
NAI: Naṣīḥat Ahl al-Īmān fī l’-Radd ‘alā Manṭiq al-Yūnān
NU: Naẓm al-‘Igīān
QM: Al-Qawl al-Mushriq fī Tahrim al-Ishtigāl bi ‘Ilm al-Manṭiq
QQ: Qūt al-Qulūb
REI: Revue des Etudes Islamiques
RHR: Revue de l’Histoire des Religions
SAH: Sharaf Asšāb al-Hadīth
SAN: Siyar A’lām al-Nubalā’
SI: Studia Islamica
SM: Ṣawa’al-Manṭiq wa l’-Kalām ‘an Fannay al-Manṭiq wa l’-Kalām
SU: Sharḥ Usāl I’tiqād Ahl al-Sūnna wa’l-Jamā’a
TH: Ṭabaqāt al-Ḥuffāz
TI: Tā’irīḥ al-Īlām
TM: Ṭabaqāt al-Mufassirīn
TMM: Tartīb al-Madārik wa Taqrīb al-Masālik li Ma’rīfāt A’lām Madhhab Mālik
TSK: Ṭabaqāt al-Shāfi‘iyya al-Kubrā
WW: al-Wāfī bi‘l-Wafayāt
ZDMG: Zeitschrift für Deutsche Morgenländische Gesellschaft